## *Historic Preservation: Caring for Our Expanding Legacy*

MICHAEL A. TOMLAN

Springer, New York, NY, 2015. 383 pp., 153 figs., 32 tables, index. $79.99 cloth.

This book joins a distinguished list of studies of the historic preservation movement in the United States that have been published in the last 20 years (Diane Barthel, *Historic Preservation: Collective Memory and Historical Identity*, Rutgers University Press, New Brunswick, NJ, 1996; William J. Murtagh, *Keeping Time: The History and Theory of Preservation in America*, John Wiley & Sons, Hoboken, NJ, 2005; Robert E. Stipe [editor], *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*, University of North Carolina Press, 2003; and Norman Tyler, Ted J. Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler, *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*, Norton, New York, NY, 2009). Readers of this journal are also likely to be familiar with the somewhat differently focused works of Thomas F. King.

The particular value of this work lies in its combination of a wide historical, social, and political contextual approach, combined with an authoritative and detailed treatment of the economics and politics of historic preservation at the local level. The latter are covered particularly in chapters 4–6, which should be required reading for the large number of historical archaeologists involved in the wider world of cultural resources management (CRM) and historic preservation, since there is clearly scope for much more engagement by archaeologists in this area. The contributions of David Listokin of Rutgers University are clear in these chapters and in other places in the book, as Tomlan notes.

The introduction provides a helpful overview of the aims and organization of the book. Tomlan expresses his intention to cover "almost all of the disciplines involved in the field of historic preservation" (excluding only the history and conservation of building materials): archaeology is therefore explicitly included, and in fact receives rather more treatment than the sparse entries in the index suggest. However, the persistent "otherness" of archaeology is early suggested in Tomlan's five reasons for saving things: immediate personal and social usefulness; economic prudence; as remembrances; for their aesthetic qualities; or because they have contemporary spiritual and or religious value. Archaeology, as a discipline primarily concerned with acquiring and analyzing information about the past, is not necessarily closely engaged with these reasons (unless we have a role as "remembrancers").

This can be seen, for example, in the discussion of "documentation" in chapter 6, where the emphasis is on the importance of recorded data for the immediate needs of preservation and restoration, rather than as research on the human past. This is well captured in the imagined voice of a historic preservation novice questioning whether documentation is even necessary if a building

is to be demolished rather than restored! Tomlan naturally refutes this extreme view, but such a view of the purpose of documentation certainly raises archaeological eyebrows toward the stratosphere.

The first two chapters provide an informative overview of the development of the historic preservation movement up to the mid-1980s. Highlighted in chapter 1 is the influential role played by the Smithsonian Institution's first publication, *Ancient Monuments of the Mississippi Valley*, and its subsequent review by Charles Norton (later the first president of the Archaeological Institute of America), in increasing awareness of the need to preserve American archaeological sites. Archaeological preservationists were among the estimated 100,000 members of historical organizations in the early 1900s.

Chapter 2 includes a treatment of the development of CRM as a distinct enterprise within historic preservation. Tomlan correctly notes that this approach emerged from the archaeological community in the 1970s. He then characterizes it as a branch of archaeology only, a restricting image that the CRM industry is still trying to dispel, preferring to see it as the profession of "managing historic places of archaeological, architectural, and historical interest and considering such places in compliance with environmental and historic preservation laws" (Thomas F. King, *Cultural Resource Laws and Practice: An Introductory Guide*, Altamira, Lanham, MD, 1998, p. 6).

Chapter 3 begins with a thorough summary of federal, state, and local enactments, roles, and authority over historic preservation followed by an informative review of the history of judicial reaction to preservation laws and legal challenges to them. Much of this discussion centers around the balance to be struck between the interest of the public at large and the hardships faced by individuals affected by the laws and regulations: the issue of "taking," which goes far beyond the field of historic preservation.

Chapter 4 "Changing Our Economic Outlook" and chapter 5 "Meeting the Financial Challenges" are extremely important and well worth taking the time to absorb. Together they provide a magisterial overview of how historic preservation fits into the wider world of planning, development, urban renewal, and economics in the United States. Both are extensively illustrated with tables and diagrams that provide massive amounts of data on these issues.

Chapter 5 leads the reader through the wide range of mechanisms available to rehabilitate and restore historic properties: the world of income tax credits, easements, property tax incentives, and programmatic support at federal and state level. Except for the last of these, one is left with the impression that "public" archaeology has been very much on the periphery of this world, one in which the financial resources involved can be very substantial. Table 5.17, for example, shows that of about $2.2 billion of annual federal and state subsidies and funding for historic preservation, only about $600 million (27%) comes from programmatic sources (such as federal transportation enhancement programs) with which CRM archaeology regularly comes into contact. The remainder comes from a range of tax credit mechanisms.

"Documentation, Context, and Design" (chap. 6) returns us to the world of cultural resources: how we identify, evaluate, and treat them. Much attention is understandably paid to issues such as design standards, sustainability, and "green" issues, and to

the three R's (rehabilitation, reconstruction, and rehabilitation). Tomlan picks out the archaeological component of the San Francisco Presidio survey for special mention because of its strong public education and outreach programming, an important topic for CRM that could perhaps have been given more space in the volume as a whole. This would fit comfortably into the "Advocacy and Ethics" chapter, where the importance of educating and engaging the public is stressed. It is a truism to those of us engaged in the field that public archaeology programs are invariably a highly successful and visible way to gain support for historic preservation projects of all kinds, and to provide highly enriching education opportunities. This is a productive interface between historic preservation (as conventionally conceived) and archaeology. It deserves more attention than it currently receives.

The penultimate chapter, "Placing Greater Faith in Religion," explores the complexity of church-and-state constitutional relationships, the tension that can ensue over historic preservation designations, and positive developments and trends. The final chapter is an effective four-page summary of the whole book.

Tomlan's explicit recognition of archaeology as a part of historic preservation is very welcome and reflects a continuing trend in preservation generally (we no longer hear much about the "archaeological problem"). With an estimated 70% of professional archaeologists in the United States now working in CRM, and a further 15% in governmental agencies with broadly historic preservation responsibilities, it is very clear that archaeology as a discipline is acquiring the bulk of its information about the human past of the United States from within a historic preservation framework. This is both an opportunity and a challenge.

The book is well illustrated, and each chapter is supported by extensive footnoting and bibliographic references. The text would have benefited from more careful copyediting. Apart from this minor flaw, this is an excellent overview of the subject and should certainly be perused by archaeologists with an interest in the social dimensions of what they do.

Ian Burrow
114 Taylor Terrace
Hopewell, NJ 08525